

Staff Policy Summary
ARIN-2020-2: Reinstatement of Organizations Removed from
Waitlist by Implementation of ARIN-2019-16

Contents:

- Current Text
- Staff and Legal Review
- History
- Relevant Milestones
- Relevant Votes/Floor Counts
- Petition Supporters and Affiliations

Shepherds: Alyssa Moore, Anita Nikolich

Current Text (24 March 2020)

AC Assessment of Conformance with the Principles of Internet Number Resource Policy:

This Draft Policy is fair, impartial, and technically sound. The intent of this draft policy is to reinstate organizations to the waitlist that were removed via ARIN-2019-16's adoption if their total IPv4 holdings amount to a /18 or less. This would allow reinstated organizations to extend their two-year approval and qualify for up to a /22. This excludes any organizations who have since had requests met via the transfer market, or any that fulfill their requests with the transfer market after ARIN 2020-2 is implemented.

Note also that the Advisory Council changed the name of the policy upon learning the term "grandfather clause" has historical roots in preventing former slaves and their descendants from voting in the American South.

Problem Statement:

The implementation of the ARIN-2019-16 Advisory Council Recommendation Regarding NRPM 4.1.8: Unmet Requests caused some organizations to be removed from the waiting list that were approved under the old policy's eligibility criteria. These organizations should have been grandfathered when the waitlist was reopened to allow them to receive an allocation of IPv4 up to the new policy's maximum size constraint of a /22.

Policy Statement:

Add section 4.1.8.3 (temporary language in the NRPM to remain until the policy objective is achieved)

Restoring organizations to the waitlist

ARIN will restore organizations that were removed from the waitlist at the adoption of ARIN-2019-16 to their previous position if their total holdings of IPv4 address space amounts to a /18 or less. The maximum size aggregate that a reinstated organization may qualify for is a /22.

All restored organizations extend their 2-year approval by [number of months between July 2019 and implementation of new policy]. Any requests met through a transfer will be considered fulfilled and removed from the waiting list.

Timetable for Implementation: Immediate

Anything Else:

While attending ARIN 44 and discussing this with other community members the vast majority indicated that they agreed that some organizations were treated unfairly. This proposal is a remedy.

Staff and Legal Review (9 September 2020)

Summary (Staff Understanding)

ARIN-2020-2 would restore organizations to the waitlist that were removed via implementation of ARIN-2019-16 if their total IPv4 holdings amount to a /18 or less, allowing them to extend their two-year approval and qualify for up to a /22. This would exclude any organizations who have since had requests met via the transfer market as well as any organizations that do so after ARIN 2020-2 is implemented.

Comments

ARIN Staff Comments

Staff would implement this by conducting a one-time IPv4 distribution to applicable organizations.

The text is clear and understandable, and could be implemented as written.

ARIN General Counsel – Legal Assessment

The proposed policy does not create any material legal issues.

Resource Impact

Implementation of this policy would have a minimal resource impact. It is estimated that it would take three months to implement, and would require:

- Staff training
- Updated guidelines and internal procedures
- Updated documentation on website

Proposal/Draft Policy Text Assessed: 24 March Version

History:

ARIN's initial IPv4 Waiting List policy had no limits either on the block size or on the amount of space a requester could have registered in order to be eligible to receive a block from the waiting list. ARIN staff noticed that most of the large blocks (/16, /17) issued via the waiting list were being transferred as soon as the (at the time) one year waiting period expired. As a part of our normal policy experience reporting process, staff provided this feedback to the community, reasoning that the community may not have intended for most of the waiting list space to go to a few organizations who then transferred it to unrelated parties. The community then suspended waiting list issuance and subsequently passed ARIN-2019-16, which instituted three significant restrictions on issuance of IPv4 blocks from the ARIN waiting list:

- /22 maximum block size
- Must have a /20 or less of space to be eligible
- Five year waiting period on transfers

When implementing 2019-16, staff interpreted its intent as applying these new limits to those requests currently on the waiting list. This interpretation was included in the Staff & Legal review. As a result, 37 organizations had a request removed from the waiting list due to having more than a /20 equivalent of space. Subsequent to discussion of the implementation of 2019-16 at the ARIN 44 public policy meeting and its implications for organizations approved and already on the waiting list, policy proposal ARIN-prop-282 was introduced as a potential remedy to process those organizations per the prior criteria. The ARIN AC accepted the policy proposal as Draft Policy 2020-2 and engaged in discussion of it with the ARIN community via the Public Policy Mailing List (ARIN PPML)

As a result of the community discussion, Draft Policy 2020-2 was revised to incorporate the new maximum block size of /22 that was contained in 2019-16 and a limit of /18 for total IPv4 address holdings. The policy was discussed at the ARIN 45 public policy meeting, and the ARIN AC determined it was suitable to be discussed as a Recommended Draft Policy (RDP) at the ARIN 46 public policy meeting. After ARIN 46, the ARIN AC confirmed that RDP 2020-2 met the Principles of Internet Number Resource Policy and recommended it for Last Call discussion on the ARIN PPML list before recommending it to the ARIN Board of Trustees. As a result of the Last Call discussion, the ARIN AC determined that they no longer recommended adoption and after the Advisory Council's failure to act within the allotted time (60 days) to send a Recommended Draft Policy in last call to the Board of Trustees for consideration, ARIN 2020-2 reverted to Draft Policy status.

On 10 January 2021, a petition was requested to bring Draft Policy ARIN-2020-2 from last call to the Board of Trustees as Recommended Draft Policy for adoption consideration. The petition was opened for a period of five days, and was successful, having received support from 35 unique individuals representing 35 unique organizations.

Milestone Timeline:

7 February 2019 - Board of Trustees Suspends issuance of number resources per Number Resource Policy Manual (NRPM) section 4.1.8.2. (Fulfilling unmet needs), and refers NRPM section 4.1.8 to the Advisory Council for their recommendation.

29 April 2019 - Advisory Council introduces Recommended Draft Policy ARIN-2019-16 on PPML.

1 May 2019 - Staff and General Counsel perform and deliver a Staff and Legal Review of ARIN-2019-16.

24 May 2019 - Advisory Council revises ARIN-2019-16.

20 June 2019 - Board of Trustees Adopts ARIN-2019-16 and reinstates the full operation of the Number Resource Policy Manual Sections 4.1.8, 4.1.8.1, and 4.1.8.2, effective immediately.

10 July 2019 - ARIN-2019-16 is implemented. It introduced three major changes to the waiting list: a /22 maximum block size, a requirement the organization have a /20 equivalent or less already registered, and a five-year waiting period before transferring. The Staff and Legal Review of ARIN-2019-16 noted a potential for confusion regarding application of the policy to those on the waiting list at the time of implementation:

It is also clear the AC draft intends to have the effect of reducing the size of the block to those who were on the list before suspension occurred. The clearest possible language should be used to provide notice that ARIN may interpret the proposed policy will limit the previously approved requests for size. It would be best to have the AC clearly articulate its intention in this regard.

Staff comments also addressed this issue and provided guidance to the community:

ARIN staff would immediately perform an audit of the current waitlist and remove and inform any organization that holds more than a /20 in IPv4 space excluding 4.4 and 4.10. ARIN staff would reach out to each organization currently on the waitlist to verify their justifications for a maximum of /22, /23 and /24 and to confirm their minimum acceptable block size. ARIN staff would inform all current and future requests of the new policy guidelines prior to approval.

Based on this guidance, when 2019-16 was implemented, staff applied it to the existing waiting list. 37 organizations had a request removed from the waiting list and 79 organizations had their maximum block size lowered to /22.

31 October 2019 – Implementation of 2019-16 is discussed at ARIN 44.

10 January 2020 - Tom Pruitt authors and submits ARIN-prop-282: Grandfathering of Organizations Removed from Waitlist by Implementation of ARIN-2019-16

24 March 2020 - ARIN-prop-282 becomes Draft Policy 2020-2

17 June 2020 - ARIN-2020-2 is discussed at ARIN 45 (https://www.arin.net/vault/participate/meetings/reports/ARIN_45/ppm2_transcript.html#anchor4)

9 September 2020 - Staff and General Counsel perform and deliver a Staff and Legal Review of ARIN-2020-2.

22 September - Draft Policy ARIN-2020-2 is moved to Recommended Draft Policy Status.

14 October 2020 - Recommended Draft Policy ARIN-2020-2 is discussed at ARIN 46 (https://www.arin.net/participate/meetings/ARIN46/ppm1_transcript/#recommended-draft-policy-arin-2020-2-reinstatement-of-organizations-removed-from-waitlist-by-implementation-of-arin-2019-16).

20 October 2020 - Recommended Draft Policy ARIN-2020-2 is sent to a standard 14-day Last Call period.

3 November 2020 - Last Call period expires.

19 November 2020 - Advisory Council discusses, but does not advance Recommended Draft Policy ARIN 2020-2 to the ARIN Board for adoption consideration.

17 December 2020 - Advisory Council discusses, but does not advance Recommended Draft Policy ARIN 2020-2 to the ARIN Board for adoption consideration.

6 January 2021 - Per ARIN's Policy Development Process, Recommended Draft Policy ARIN 2020-2 reverts to Draft Policy status, having not been advanced within 60 days of the conclusion of the Last Call period. A petition initiation window is opened for five days.

10 January 2021 - Tom Pruitt of Stratus Networks requested a petition to bring Draft Policy ARIN-2020-2 to the Board of Trustees for adoption consideration.

11 January 2021 - Open petition is announced, five-day petition support window begins.

16 January 2021 - Petition support window closes with support from 35 individuals representing at least 35 organizations.

Relevant Votes and Floor Counts:

- ARIN 46: 119 in attendance, 42 in favor, 14 against
- 17 September 2020 Advisory Council motion to move to Recommended Draft Policy status:
 - Carried, 12 in favor, 2 against (AD, JP)
- 15 October 2020 Advisory Council motion to move to Last Call:
 - Carried, 10 in favor and four against (OD, AD, JP, RS)
- 19 November 2020 Advisory Council motion to revert to Draft Policy:
 - Failed, 11 against and three in favor (OD, AN, JP)
- 19 November 2020 Advisory Council motion to move to Board of Trustees for adoption consideration:
 - Failed, eight in favor (AM, AP, LS, CT, AT, AW, CW, TM), and six against (OD, AD, KH, AN, JP, KR)

- 17 December 2020 Advisory Council motion to move to Board of Trustees for adoption consideration:
 - Failed, four in favor (AN, AP, CT, AW), and 9 against (AD, KH, JP, KR, LS, RS, KT, CW, TM)

ARIN-2020-2 Petition Supporters and Affiliations:

1. Tom Pruitt, Stratus Networks
2. Jason Brandt, Pearl Insurance
3. Mike Burns, IPTrading.com
4. Jon Bachtold, CIRBN, LLC.
5. Jeff Borelli, Connecting Point Computer Centers
6. Jason Baugher, Adams TelSystems, Inc.
7. Zak Horn, MCC Network Services, LLC
8. Chad Geiser, Integrity Technology Solutions
9. Isaiah Olson, Olson Tech, LLC
10. Sepehr Ahmadi, Gocode.it
11. Ben Rogers, Illinois CancerCare
12. Jeremy Mohr, RLI Insurance
13. Cameron Shearhod, CISSP
14. Annette Ogden, Anderson Electric, Inc.
15. Joe Caracci, CC Services Inc.
16. Blake Ozier, Springfield Electric Supply Company
17. Rudi Daniel, consultant
18. Ben Thornton, Opex Technologies
19. Steve Allen, Heartland Cable Inc.
20. Hayee Bokhari, Cronomagic Canada, Inc.
21. William Munstedt, Xerox Corporation
22. Mike Kesler, Connectivityu
23. Keaton Alexander Guger Lair, Red Lily Internet
24. Peter Coyne, American Data & Voice Networks
25. Mark Gillis, MH Equipment
26. Mark Kiwiet, KK Worx, Inc.
27. David Schudel, Pearl Technology
28. Steve Weiss, Versa Networks
29. Christian Lefrançois, Diffusion Fermont
30. George Myers, Backlund Investment
31. Eric Lee, MTC Communications, Inc.
32. Max Clark, Clarksys Inc
33. Herb Kuryliw, Illinois Fiber Resources Group
34. Jay Wendelin, STL/BTS
35. Bret Voypick, Voy-Tel, Inc.

Summary of Customer Impact of ARIN-2019-16 implementation:

When implementing 2019-16, staff interpreted its intent as applying to requests currently on the waiting list. As a result, 37 organizations had a request removed from the waiting list due to having more than a /20 equivalent of space. ARIN-2020-2 seeks to provide these organizations with up to a /22 each.

ARIN staff's experience with the waiting list policy was presented 4 October 2018 at ARIN 42. Some of the observations noted:

- ~24% of the space issued to the waiting list had been transferred (most in /16 or /17 units)
- 4 orgs currently on the waiting list have more than a /16
- At least one case where multiple large blocks were obtained by multiple organizations and transferred via 8.2 to a single organization
- Blocks are being transferred via 8.2 transfers that are probably specified recipient transfers

When 2019-16 was implemented, staff applied it to the existing waiting list. 37 organizations had a request removed from the waiting list and 79 organizations had their maximum block size lowered to /22.