



Recommended Draft Policy

ARIN-2015-3

David Farmer

Recommended Draft Policy

ARIN-2015-3



Remove 30-Day Utilization Requirement in End-User IPv4 Policy

Author: David Huberman

AC Shepherds: David Farmer & Leif Sawyer

Problem Statement



End-user policy is intended to provide end-users with a one year supply of IP addresses. Qualification for a one-year supply requires the network operator to utilize at least 25% of the requested addresses within 30 days. This text is unrealistic and should be removed.

Current Policy Text

4.3.3 Utilization rate



Utilization rate of address space is a key factor in justifying a new assignment of IP address space. Requesters must show exactly how previous address assignments have been utilized and must provide appropriate details to verify their one-year growth projection. The basic criteria that must be met are:

- * A 25% immediate utilization rate, and
- * A 50% utilization rate within one year.

...

Proposed Policy Change



4.3.3 Utilization rate

Utilization rate of address space is a key factor in justifying a new assignment of IP address space. Requesters must show exactly how previous address assignments have been utilized and must provide appropriate details to verify their one-year growth projection. The basic criteria that must be met are:

- ~~* A 25% immediate utilization rate, and~~
- * A 50% utilization rate within one year.

...

Editorial Changes

4.3.3 Utilization rate



Utilization rate of address space is a key factor in justifying a new assignment of IP address space. Requesters must show exactly how previous address assignments have been utilized and must provide appropriate details to verify their one-year growth projection.

The basic ~~criteria~~ criterion that must be met ~~are~~:
*A is a 50% utilization rate within one year.

...

Comments



- It often takes longer than 30 days to stage equipment and start actually using the addresses.
- Growth is often not that regimented; the forecast is to use X addresses over the course of a year, not to use 25% of X within 30 days.

Comments - Continued



- This policy text applies to additional address space requests. It is incompatible with the requirements of other additional address space request justification which indicates that 80% utilization of existing space is sufficient to justify new space.

Comments - Continued



- In the face of ARIN exhaustion, some ISPs are starting to not give out /24 (or larger) blocks. So the justification for the 25% rule that previously existed (and in fact, applied for many years) is no longer germane.

Discussion to this point



- Good amount of discussion on PPML
- Presented at the NANOG 64 PPC
- Presented at ARIN36 (Montréal)

- Agreement there is an issue
- Strong Support
- With small amount of Opposition

Summary of Opposition



- This removes the only tangible and verifiable claim
- All that remains is a one year forward looking projection
- Would like tangible and verifiable commitment to use half the address space within one year

Staff Assessment



- This policy more closely aligns with the way staff applies the existing policy in relation to 8.3 transfers. Because there is no longer an IPv4 free pool and many IPv4 requests are likely to be satisfied by 8.3 transfers

Staff Assessment - Continued



- Note that both NRPM 4.3.3 and NRPM 4.2.3.6 contain references to obsolete RFC 2050. Additionally, 4.2.3.6 references the 25% immediate use (within 30 days of issuance) requirement.
- Staff suggests removing the two RFC 2050 References

Feedback from Montréal



- Keep a narrow focus on NRPM 4.3.3, don't complicate this with other issues
- Clean up the RFC2050 references and NRPM 4.2.3.6 separately

Discussion Items



- Is this ready for Last Call?
 - **Can/should we address the opposition's issue?**
 - **If we do, should we also deal with NRPM 4.2.3.6 and the RFC2050 references?**