

# Draft Policy ARIN-2019-7: Elimination of the Waiting List

Shepherds: Alyssa Moore & Amy Potter

## ARIN-2019-7: Elimination of the Waiting List Background



- A non-trivial fraction of IPv4 address space issued under the 4.1.8 waitlist policy was being "flipped" as soon as it became eligible (1 year after being issued.) This problem seems to be exacerbated in larger allocations (shorter prefixes).
- On January 17, 2019 (in accordance with the provisions of the Section 10.2 of the Policy Development Process), the ARIN Board of Trustees suspended NRPM section 4.1.8 Unmet Requests, thereby shelving the issuance of number resources per NRPM section 4.1.8.2. Fulfilling unmet needs.
- The Advisory Council developed a list of potential policy actions to address the issue. The community has responded with four separate policy proposals related to the waitlist.

## ARIN-2019-7: Elimination of the Waiting List **Problem Statement**



The ARIN "Unfulfilled Requests" policy (NRPM 4.1.8 et seq) creates an opportunity for an ARIN member to claim need for number resources, wait for those resources to become available via returns or reclamations, acquire them, wait a year and a day, and then profit from them via a Section 8.3 transfer.



 In a post-depletion environment in which needs for additional number resources are met via the secondary market, this policy provides valuable number resources essentially for free, creating an opportunity for windfall profits and incentivizing various kinds of misrepresentation or manipulation of registration services.



 ARIN can avoid this problem by abolishing the waiting list and transferring returned and reclaimed resources to organizations that have qualified via the existing 8.3 process.



## ARIN-2019-7: Elimination of the Waiting List Policy Statement



### 4.1.8. Unmet Requests

In the event that ARIN does not have a contiguous block of addresses of sufficient size to fulfill a qualified request, ARIN will provide the requesting organization with the option to specify the smallest block size they'd be willing to accept, equal to or larger than the applicable minimum size specified elsewhere in ARIN policy. If such a smaller block is available, ARIN will fulfill the request with the largest single block available that fulfills the request. If no such block is available, the organization will be provided the option to be placed on a waiting list of pre-qualified recipients, listing both the block size qualified for and the smallest block size acceptable.

Repeated requests, in a manner that would circumvent 4.1.6, are not allowed: an organization may only receive one allocation, assignment, or transfer every 3 months, but ARIN, at its sole discretion, may waive this requirement if the requester can document a change in circumstances since their last request that could not have been reasonably foreseen at the time of the original request, and which now justifies additional space. Qualified requesters whose request cannot be immediately met will also be advised of the availability of the transfer mechanism in section 8.3 as an alternative mechanism to obtain IPv4 addresses.

### 4.1.8.1. Waiting List

The position of each qualified request on the waiting list will be determined by the date it was approved. Each organization may have one approved request on the waiting list at a time.

### 4.1.8.2. Fulfilling Unmet Needs

As address blocks become available for allocation, ARIN will fulfill requests on a first-approved basis, subject to the size of each available address block and a timely re-validation of the original request. Requests will not be partially filled. Any requests met through a transfer will be considered fulfilled and removed from the waith list.

- Delete section 4.1.8. Unmet Requests as well as sections 4.1.8.1. Waiting List and 4.1.8.2. Fulfilling Unmet Needs
- Add policy section: 4.1.10 -Returned and Reclaimed Resources
- ARIN will auction returned and reclaimed IPv4 number resources to recipients qualified under Section 8.3. Revenues realized from this activity will be allocated for purposes as directed by the Board of Trustees.

## ARIN-2019-7: Elimination of the Waiting List Comments



 The specific auction methods and implementation details used to distribute the returned address pool are outside of the purview of the Public Policy Process; they are intentionally left to the Board to sort out.





[Get it? 'Cause it's out of scope...
Hey, I tried.]

## ARIN-2019-7: Elimination of the Waiting List Discussion



- There has been no discussion about this policy on PPML.
- Does the community support eliminating the IPv4 waitlist?



???

## Thank you.

Any Questions?







### Discussion





